Modelling A User Population for Designing Information Retrieval Metrics

Tetsuya Sakai (NewsWatch, Inc.) tetsuyasakai@acm.org Stephen Robertson (Microsoft Research Cambridge) ser@microsoft.com

EVIA 2008, December 16, 2008@NII, Tokyo

TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions



- Used widely since the advent of TREC
- Mean over topics is referred to as "MAP"
- Cannot handle graded relevance (but many IR researchers just love it)

Criticisms of (Mean) Average Precision ((M)AP)

- AP may be a poor measure of user performance/satisfaction [Turpin/Scholer SIGIR 06 etc.]
- AP lacks a user model
- "there is no single user application that directly motivates MAP" [Buckley/Voorhees TREC book]

"there is no plausible search model that corresponds to MAP, because no user knows in advance the number of relevant answers present in the collection..." [Moffat/Webber/Zobel SIGIR 07]

"AP lacks a user model?"

Rubbish! [Robertson SIGIR 08]

Objectives

- Robertson showed that AP is a special case of Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP) which models a *population of users*.
- We generalise NCP and introduce Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU), and show that
- AP and Q-measure are in fact reasonable metrics!
- A version of NCU, which utilises graded relevance in a novel way, has high discriminative power!

Live	Search
\frown	





I need the latest information on EVIA!

Information need

ウェブ -764,000 件中 1-10 件・<u>高度な検索</u> 検索サービス:<u>画像 , 動画 , ニュース , 地図</u>Beta , <u>相談箱 , すべて表示…</u>

EVIA 2007 (NTCIR-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)

provisional schedule of the 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Crosslingual information access research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・キャッシュ ページ

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan ... Workshop Date: December 16, 2008 (Day 1 of the NTCIR-7 Meeting) Workshop Venue: ntcir.nii.ac.jp/index.php/ja/**EVIA**-2008 ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Eviaのホテル</u>

Evia ホテル予約 - 直前格安価格スペシャル … ホテル 名称 ロケーション ホテルランク 価格(〜から) www.ratestogo.com/City/JP/**Evia** ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

[ntcir:240] EVIA 2007: Call for Participation

To: ntcir@xxxxxxxx Subject: [ntcir:240] **EVIA** 2007: Call for Participation From: Atsushi Fujii <fujii@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> Date: Wed, 02 May 2007 15:46:00 +0900 (JST) research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

アンフィニ・コメルス株式会社 高級輸入家具リース ...

Evia

www.infini-commerce.co.jp/collection/modern/catteran/**evia**.ht...・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction www.eviaweb.gr · <u>+ャッシュ ページ</u>

|検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

	Nive Search	EVIA
		□ <u>日本語</u> のページだけを表示
	ウェブ 764,000 件中 1- 検索サービス: <u>画像, 動</u>	10 件 · <u>高度な検索</u> 画, <u>ニュース, 地図^{Beta}, 相談箱, すべて表示</u>
L1 (partially relevant)	EVIA 2007 (NTCIR provisional schedule of lingual information acc research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir	<u>R-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)</u> The 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Cross- ess /ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・ <u>キャッシュ ページ</u>
L3 (highly relevant)	NTCIR-7 Information NTCIR-7 Information R 16, 2008 (Day 1 of the ntcir.nii.ac.jp/index.php	<u>on Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA</u> etrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan Workshop Date: December NTCIR-7 Meeting) Workshop Venue: o/ja/ EVIA -2008 ・ <u>キャッシュ ページ</u>
L0 (not relevant)	<mark>Evia</mark> のホテル Evia ホテル予約 - 直前 www.ratestogo.com/Ci	i格安価格スペシャル ホテル 名称 ロケーション ホテルランク 価格(~から) ty/JP/ Evia ・ <u>キャッシュ ページ</u>
L2 (relevant)	[ntcir:240] EVIA 20 To: ntcir@xxxxxxxxx <fujii@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir.</fujii@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx 	<u>07: Call for Participation</u> Subject: [ntcir:240] EVIA 2007: Call for Participation From: Atsushi Fujii xxxxx> Date: Wed, 02 May 2007 15:46:00 +0900 (JST) /archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・ <u>キャッシュ ページ</u>
L0 (not relevant)	<u>アンフィニ・コメルス</u> Evia www.infini-commerce.c	株式会社 高級輸入家具リース co.jp/collection/modern/catteran/ evia .ht ・ <u>キャッシュ ページ</u>
L0 (not relevant)	<u>Υπό κατασκευή - U</u> Υπό κατασκευή - Unde www. evia web.gr • <u>+ +</u>	nder construction er construction ッシュ ページ
L3 (highly relevant)	<u>検索メイニアック! (</u> フレッシュアイトップ 情報 音?)	<u>nformation Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008</u> 最検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和

Where do users stop scanning the list?



I stop at

rank 4

- ウェブ - 764,000 件中 1-10 件・<u>高度な検索</u> - 検索サービス:<u>画像, 動画, ニュース, 地図^{Beta}, 相談箱, すべて表示…</u>

EVIA 2007 (NTCIR-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)

provisional schedule of the 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Crosslingual information access research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・キャッシュ ページ

Q

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan ... Workshop Date: December 16, 2008 (Day 1 of the NTCIR-7 Meeting) Workshop Venue: ntcir.nii.ac.jp/index.php/ja/**EVIA**-2008 ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Eviaのホテル</u>

Evia ホテル予約 - 直前格安価格スペシャル ... ホテル名称 ロケーション ホテルランク 価格(〜から) www.ratestogo.com/City/JP/Evia ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

[ntcir:240] EVIA 2007: Call for Participation

To: ntcir@xxxxxxxx Subject: [ntcir:240] **EVIA** 2007: Call for Participation From: Atsushi Fujii <fujii@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> Date: Wed, 02 May 2007 15:46:00 +0900 (JST) research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

L0 アンフィニ・コメルス株式会社 高級輸入家具リース ...

Evia

LO

_2

LO

0 0

www.infini-commerce.co.jp/collection/modern/catteran/**evia**.ht...・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction

www.**evia**web.gr · <u>キャッシュ ベージ</u>

- 検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)



pu: Uniform Distribution over Relevant Documents

🔽 Lines Consula 🖉 📼 🗛



<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction

www.**evia**web.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>



|0|

- 検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

Q

prb: Rank-Biased Distribution over Relevant Docs

🔽 Lines Consulation 🖉 📼 🗰



ウェブ 764,000 件中 1-10 件・高度な検索 検索サービス:画像,動画,ニュース,地図Beta,相談箱,すべて表示...

EVIA 2007 (NTCIR-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)

provisional schedule of the 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Crosslingual information access

Q

research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・キャッシュ ページ

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan ... Workshop Date: December 16,200 ntcir.nii. ASSUMPTIONS:



L2

|0|

- Evia Users stop at a relevant doc;
- www.rat - Users tend to stop [ntcir:2



research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

アンフィニ・コメルス株式会社 高級輸入家具リース ... LO

Evia

www.infini-commerce.co.jp/collection/modern/catteran/**evia**.ht...・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction

www.eviaweb.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>



検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

pgu: Graded-Uniform Distribution over Relevant Docs

en Consula I en un



www.eviaweb.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>



- 検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions



pu: Uniform Distribution over Relevant Documents



That is,

- AP is a special case of NCP.
- It is an expectation of utility/cost over a user population whose stopping probability is uniform across all relevant documents.
- Hence, AP is in fact a reasonable metric!



TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions

We generalise NCP in two ways

 ∞

n=1

 ∞

n=1

 $NCP = \sum p_s(n)P(n)$

 $NCU = \sum p_s(n)NU(n)$

Stopping probability: *pu* (uniform) *prb* (rank-biased) *pgu* (graded-uniform)

Normalised Utility: **BR(n) (blended ratio)** which generalises **P(n)**

pu: Uniform Distribution over Relevant Documents

🔽 Lines Consula 🖉 📼 🗛



<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction

www.**evia**web.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>



|0|

- 検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

Q

prb: Rank-Biased Distribution over Relevant Docs

🔽 Lines Consulation 🖉 📼 🗰



ウェブ 764,000 件中 1-10 件・高度な検索 検索サービス:画像,動画,ニュース,地図Beta,相談箱,すべて表示...

EVIA 2007 (NTCIR-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)

provisional schedule of the 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Crosslingual information access

Q

research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・キャッシュ ページ

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan ... Workshop Date: December 16,200 ntcir.nii. ASSUMPTIONS:



L2

|0|

- Evia Users stop at a relevant doc;
- www.rat - Users tend to stop [ntcir:2



research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

アンフィニ・コメルス株式会社 高級輸入家具リース ... LO

Evia

www.infini-commerce.co.jp/collection/modern/catteran/**evia**.ht...・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction</u>

Υπό κατασκευή - Under construction

www.eviaweb.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>



検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ...

フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(不協和 音?)

γ : top-heaviness parameter for *prb*



Relevant documents found in the ranked list

pgu: Graded-Uniform Distribution over Relevant Docs



Blended Ratio (BR)

Normalised Cumulative GainPrecisionfor handling graded relevance

BR(n) =

 $\frac{f(n) + \beta \sum_{i=1}^{n} g(i)}{n + \beta \sum_{i=1}^{n} g^{*}(i)}$

A large β represents a very persistent user; $\beta = 0$ reduces BR to P

BR is suitable as a utility/cost function because, given the stopping point *n*, it does NOT matter where the relevant documents are within top *n*.

NCU family

 $NCU = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_s(n) NU(n)$

Stopping probability: prb (rank-biased) with top-heaviness parameter γ (γ =1 reduces prb to pu) pgu (graded-uniform) with stopping weights (flat weights reduces pgu to pu) Normalised Utility given the stopping point:BR(n)(blended ratio) with persistence parameter β (β =0 reduces BR(n) to P(n))

TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions

Comparing a system ranking by Metric *M* to that by AP

- Kendall's rank correlation
- Monotonic function of the probability that a randomly chosen system pair is ordered identically in two rankings
- Yilmaz/Aslam/Robertson (YAR) rank correlation [SIGIR 08]

Monotonic function of the probability that a randomly chosen system and one ranked above it are ordered identically in two rankings Assumes that the top ranks are the most important Not symmetrical, but is almost symmetrical in practice

YAR rank correlation with AP (NCU $u, \beta = 0$): NTCIR-6J



YAR rank correlation with AP (NCU $u, \beta = 0$): TREC03



TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions

Measuring discriminative power of metrics [Sakai SIGIR06]

 Given a set of systems and a significance level α, for how many system pairs can a metric detect statistical significance?

Probability of Type I error $\alpha = 0.05 \Leftrightarrow 95\%$ confidence

- Sakai's method uses the bootstrap test, and can also estimate the absolute performance difference required to achieve statistical significance (e.g. "a difference of 0.20 is usually statistically significant")
- Sakai's method and the Voorhees/Buckley swap method [SIGIR 02] give similar results in practice

Discriminative power at α =0.05: NTCIR-6J



Discriminative power at α =0.05: TREC03





TALK OUTLINE

- 1. Objectives
- 2. Normalised Cumulative Precision (NCP)
- 3. Normalised Cumulative Utility (NCU)
- 4. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Resemblance to Average Precision
- 5. Evaluating Evaluation Metrics: Discriminative Power
- 6. Conclusions

Conclusions

We defined NCU, whose components are:

- Probability distribution of the user's stopping behaviour (*pu*, *prb*, *pgu*)
- Blended Ratio (BR) as the utility/cost function given the stopping point

and showed that:

- Heavy rank-bias (small γ) is not desirable
- AP and Q, which rely on *pu*, are reasonable metrics they emphasize long-tail users who tend to dig deep into the ranked list and achieve high discriminative power
- NCU gu, β =1 has high consistency with AP and has the highest discriminative power (utilises graded relevance for both probability distribution pgu and utility/cost BR)

🔰 Live Search 🛛 EVIA

Uniform distribution of (AP and Q) can be interpreted as...



EVIA 2007 (NTCIR-6 Pre-Meeting Workshop)

provisional schedule of the 6th NTCIR Workshop, evaluation of IR, QA, Opinion, Trend and Cross lingual information access research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/ntcir-ws6/pmw-en.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Site - EVIA

NTCIR-7 Information Retrieval Evaluation Workshop in Tokyo, Japan ... Workshop Date: Decemb 16, 2008 (Day 1 of the NTCIR-7 Meeting) Workshop Venue: ntcir.nii.ac.jp/index.php/ja/**EVIA**-2008 ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

<u>Eviaのホテル</u>

_3

L0

Evia ホテル 予約 - 直前格安価格スペシャル … ホテル 名称 ロケーション ホテルランク 価格(〜から) www.ratestogo.com/City/JP/Evia ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

[ntcir:240] EVIA 2007: Call for Participation

To: ntcir@xxxxxxxx Subject: [ntcir:240] **EVIA** 2007: Call for Participation From: Atsushi Fujii <fujii@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> Date: Wed, 02 May 2007 15:46:00 +0900 (JST) research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/archive/ntcir/msg00199.html ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u>

emphasis

アンフィニ・コメルス株式会社 高級輸入家具リース ... I_{0} Evia a.ht...・キャッシュ ページ www.infini-comme Long-tail user Υπό κατασι |0|Υπό κρ πευή - Under construction rw.eviaweb.gr ・<u>キャッシュ ページ</u> 0 0 検索メイニアック! (Information Retrieval Maniac!): EVIA 2008 ... _3 フレッシュアイトップ 情報検索の研究者・酒井哲也が奏でる、研究とビジネスと私生活のハーモニー。(3 音?)

ir4qa evaluation scripts

 Simple scripts for computing AP, Q, nDCG, RBP, NCU etc. are available at:

http://research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/tools/ir4qa_eval-en

🗿 http://research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/tools/ir4ga_eval-en - Microsoft Internet Explorer			
ファイル(E) 編集(E) 表示(V) お気に入り(A) ツール(T) ヘルブ(H)			
🕝 戻る 🔹 🕑 - 💌 🛃 🏠 🔎 検索 🧙 お気に入り 🊱 😥 - 🌺 🔟 - 🔜 🦓			
アドレス(D) 🕘 http://research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/tools/ir4qa_eval-en			
NTCIR Project Tools ir 4qa_eval			
[JAPANESE] [NTCIR Home] [NTCIR Tools Home]			
ir4qa_eval These information retrieval (IR) evaluation scripts were developed for the NTCIR-7 ACLIA IR4QA subtask. They can be used for other IR tasks at NTCIR, TREC, etc.			

The scripts can compute average precision, Q-measure, nDCG and some other evaluation metrics.

For more details, please read the README file included in the tar file.

Download

http://research.nii.ac.jp/ntcir/tools/ir4qa_eval.tar.gz

[JAPANESE] [NTCIR Home] [NTCIR DATA Home]

Thank you!